

Indiana Historic Preservation Review Board Minutes
April 25, 2012
Indiana Government Conference Center
Conference Room 22
302 West Washington Street
Indianapolis, Indiana 46204

Board members present: Robert E. Carter, Jr., Chairman; William Selm, Mitch Zoll, Daniel Kloc, Joshua D. Palmer, Jim Corridan, Richard A. Butler, Kevin Orme

Staff members present: DHPA Director Dr. James Glass, Frank Hurdiss, John Carr, Holly Tate, Amy Walker, David Duvall, Paul Diebold, Steve Kennedy, Dr. Rick Jones, Malia Vanaman and Susan Judy, of DHPA;

Visitors/Speakers present included Patrick Carpenter, Mary Kennedy; Staffan Peterson; Mark Dollase; Eric Wyndham, DNR Staff Attorney; Jewell Stone; Kari Carmany George; Melissa Effinger; Jeff Matern; Mark Blake; Anuradha Kumar; David Howell; Jonathon Young; Greg Jacoby; Richard Trombly; Mike Logar; David Day; Brenda Havens

Call to Order

Chairman Robert E. Carter Jr. convened the meeting at 1:32 P. M.

Approval of the February 15, 2012 meeting minutes

Chairman Carter asked for any corrections or additions to the minutes from the last meeting. There were none and a motion to approve the minutes was made by Jim Corridan and seconded by Daniel Kloc. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Carter requested the Division Director's report.

Division Director's Report:

Preserving Historic Places Conference

The Preserving Historic Places Conference in Whiting—co-sponsored by our division, Indiana University, and Indiana Landmarks and held April 11-13, was a big success. We had over 200 registered participants, and the reaction of conference attendees was enthusiastic. The four plenary speakers—Dr. Phil Scarpino of IU, James Kunstler, Stephanie Toothman, Associate Director for Cultural Resources, National Park Service, and Stephanie Meeks, President of the National Trust for Historic Preservation—were well received and we had a good mix of topics for our educational sessions, ranging in subject from underwater archaeology in Lake Michigan to African American heritage in Gary to historic courthouse preservation, to Connecting Children to Preservation. Our two workshops featured hands-on demonstrations of repairing plaster on the wall of a classroom in the historic Whiting United Methodist Church and arresting moisture in the vestibule of the Community Center Auditorium. Dr. Toothman was complimentary in her remarks about our staff—noting that the Park Service Cultural Resources staff that works with State Historic Preservation Offices considers our division staff excellent with a great knowledge of federal-state preservation programs. Mayor Joe Stahura of Whiting and the local committee made everyone feel welcome and showed outstanding hospitality.

Division awards:

At the conference, the division presented its annual awards for historic preservation. This year the Outstanding Residential Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credit Project Award went to Don and Bonnie Mills for their rehabilitation of the Abijah O'Neal II House in Montgomery County. The Outstanding Commercial Historic Rehabilitation Tax Credit Award went to Michigan Street LLC for their rehabilitation of the All American Bank Building in South Bend. The Outstanding Preservation Stewardship Award went to the Delphi Indiana Preservation Society for their stewardship and ongoing rehabilitation of the Assion Ruffing City Hall and Delphi Opera House. The National Register of Historic Places Achievement Award went to the Indiana Soldiers' and Sailors' Children's Home Alumni Association and the Indiana Department of the Military for their nomination of the campus of the Indiana Soldier's and Sailors' Children's Home to the National Register. And, the 2012 Outstanding Hoosier Preservationist Award was presented to Chief Justice Randy Shepard for his outstanding contributions to historic preservation in Indiana and nationally.

Statewide Cultural Resources Management Plan

Our staff Cultural Resources Management Plan committee has taken the substantial public comments received through our 2011 on-line survey and drafted 4 major goals and several objectives for each. Assistant Director Steve Kennedy, who has been coordinating our efforts, presented the draft goals and objectives at an educational session at the Preserving Historic Places Conference. We anticipate having a final draft available for our State Plan Advisory Committee to review in June (Richard Butler and Dan Kloc are members of the Advisory Committee). Our statute provides for the Review Board to approve the statewide preservation plan after a public hearing, and we would anticipate providing the final plan to the Board for consideration at the July 25th Review Board meeting.

We are planning a training workshop for new Review Board members on the morning of the next Review Board meeting, Wednesday, July 25. The workshop will cover the federal and state laws that the Board carries out, the National Register of Historic Places criteria and nomination process, and answer questions that Board members may have. We'll be in touch closer to July with more details, but wanted to mention for getting on calendars.

National Register Applications

1. Indi-Illi Park Historic District, Hammond, Lake County (2202)
Holly Tate, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made Richard Butler and seconded by Mitch Zoll. The motion passed unanimously.
2. Watson Park Historic District, Indianapolis, Marion County (2220)
Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made Richard Butler and seconded by William Selm. The motion passed unanimously.
3. Lewis and Sarah Boggs House, Argos vicinity, Marshall County (2221)
Holly Tate, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made Jim Corridan and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed unanimously.

4. Monterey Bandstand, Monterey, Pulaski County (2225)
Frank Hurdis, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made Dan Kloc and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed unanimously.
5. John and Cynthia Garwood Farmstead, La Porte vicinity, La Porte County (2226)
Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made Jim Corridan and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed unanimously.
6. Hoham-Klinghammer-Weckerle House and Brewery Site, Plymouth vicinity, Marshall County (2229)
Frank Hurdis, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made William Selm and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed unanimously.

Indiana Register of Historic Sites and Structures (State Register) Applications

1. Indianapolis Veteran's Administration Hospital, Marion County (State Register only, 2251)
Paul Diebold, DHPA, gave the staff comments. Indianapolis Veteran's Administration Hospital was already on the National Register of Historic places, so it is fitting that it be placed on the State Register as well. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made Dan Kloc and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed unanimously.

State Certificates of Approval

1. Application by the Indiana Department of Transportation for a certificate of approval to remove and replace Structure No. 152-45-1031F on SR 152 (Indianapolis Boulevard) over the Indiana Harbor Belt Railroad (Gibson Yard), 2.1 miles north of I-80/90 in the City of Hammond, North Township, Lake County, Indiana
John Carr, DHPA, gave the staff comments. The 17- span structure is evaluated as structurally deficient and clearance for railroad tracks does not meet the standards. A 106 review led to the 2005 MOA agreement. Staff recommends granting the replacement with written agreements. There were no additional questions or comments. A motion to approve was made Richard Butler and seconded by Dan Kloc. The motion passed unanimously.

Emergency Repair Report

(This report was taken out of order as preparatory information for Certificate of Approval Application #2)

100% State-Funded Emergency Repair Work: SR 9 over Flat Rock River (NBI No. 2410; Bridge No. 009-73-1994B), Washington Township, Shelby County, Indiana

John Carr reported that INDOT had made emergency repairs to the SR 9 Bridge and had informed the division, under the Review Board's 2002 "Guidelines for Emergency Action Using State Funds." William Selm asked about the future of the bridge beyond emergency repairs. Carr responded that a Certificate of Approval was needed to replace the bridge. INDOT had reported that emergency repairs that were needed for this bridge to maintain its viability until replacement.

2. Application by the Indiana Department of Transportation for a certificate of approval to remove and replace Structure No. 009-73-1994B on SR 9 over the Flatrock River and to alter Cave Mill Archaeological Site 12Sh349 in Washington Township, Shelby County, Indiana

John Carr gave the staff comments. This bridge is eligible for the National Register and Indiana Register as a significant example of a bridge with specially designed, skewed Parker through truss spans. A Section 106 MOA signed in 2005 concluded that there was no practical alternative to replacement of the bridge, because of its major deficiencies. Most of the mitigation measures stipulated in the MOA have been carried out, and because state funds will be used to demolish the bridge, a certificate of approval is required.

Archaeological site 12SH349 is located upstream from the bridge. It is a mill site that is eligible for the National Register. There will be an adverse effect on the site, and a Section 106 Memorandum of Agreement is under preparation to provide for mitigation.

Mark Dollase, Indiana Landmarks, spoke in opposition to the granting of Certificate of Approval and the demolition of the bridge. He stated the process was begun in 2003 and he thought the process should have come to resolution before this. He stated that in 2007, INDOT decided that the bridge could be rehabilitated and had given the bridge a "Select" rating originally. He stated that INDOT subsequently asked the Bridge Programmatic Agreement consultant to change the rating to a "non-select" rating.

Jewell Stone, scoping manager INDOT-Greenfield District and Patrick Carpenter, INDOT, provided some background about the bridge. The bridge was proposed initially by Mead and Hunt, the Bridge PA consultants, for the Select category, but no evaluation of rehabilitation potential was done at that point. Later, the Greenfield District of INDOT decided that it couldn't be rehabilitated. It was given an engineering evaluation, which concluded that almost of its historic fabric would have to be removed. A design exception couldn't be granted at the location involved.

Mark Dollase stated the bridge meets the INDOT height criteria of 28feet and the minimum for width is just 6 inches difference from the 27.9 feet needed. He asked why no design exception had been granted. Changing from 15 tons load limit to 20 tons would be feasible.

Mark Blake, INDOT program manager of the project since 2008, stated that the bridge doesn't meet current criteria for FHWA standard height (16.5 feet). The 15 ton load limit rating had been recently moved down and has caused extensive detour problems for local businesses. INDOT has received numerous complaints regarding the bridge detour and local businesses are in need of economic relief.

A motion to approve with conditions stated by John Carr previously in the staff comments was made Richard Butler and seconded by Kevin Orme. The motion was unanimously approved.

3. Application by the Indiana State Fair Commission for a certificate of approval to rehabilitate the Pepsi Coliseum at the Indiana State Fairgrounds, 1202 East 38th Street, Indianapolis, Indiana

David Duvall, DHPA, gave the staff comments. There have been 2 previous Review Board meetings concerning the rehabilitation of the Pepsi Coliseum, one at the fairgrounds in January to provide a briefing on the proposed rehabilitation and one in February, 2012 for concept approval. Present review is for developed design: preserve and restore exterior; completely remove interior arena, including service spaces and structures; retain current vestibule and adjacent portion of ground-level concourse; retain sample ticket booths, outlines of other booths in the floor; retain

terrazzo floor and retain or replace in kind ceramic block veneer for walls in vestibule and adjacent concourse., retain ceiling shape and character of existing vestibule and adjacent concourse. The addition to the south of the Coliseum will replace the open air arena (not considered historic); (the power house is considered historic); Staff recommended approval based on the seven recommendations in the staff comment.

Greg Jacoby of Browning Day Mullins Dierdorf Architects stated that they wished to delete the terrazzo specified at the February concept approval meeting for the new concourse. Jacoby stated that polished concrete will be used because of cost reasons on the second level arena. William Selm asked a question regarding the 2 remaining ticket booths. Will they still be ticket booths? Duvall responded the ticket booths may serve as interpretive centers as well as the front for 2 elevators.

Greg Jacoby of Browning Day Mullins Dierdorf Architects gave a PowerPoint presentation showing views of the Coliseum's proposed, developed design, with changes presented.

A motion to approve was made by Joshua Palmer, incorporating an amendment to the recommendations in the staff comment to provide for use of polished concrete for floors in the public concourse on the second level. Seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed unanimously.

4. Application by the Indiana State Fair Commission for a certificate of approval to rehabilitate Speed Barns #1 ((ALLEN) AND #6 (Eads) at the Indiana State Fairgrounds, 1202 East 38th Street, Indianapolis, Indiana

David Duvall gave the staff comments. There are 8 speed barns that are considered to contribute to the State Fairgrounds eligible historic district. The application is for rehabilitation of two of the barns with the greatest damage (#1 and #6), due to structural issues, insect infestation, and accumulation of moisture. The proposal asks to use synthetic materials for replacement of some siding and trim elements. The staff recommends approval with the six conditions recommended in the staff comment. There are no recommendations yet on removal of chimneys, which awaits confirmation of location and condition. Other repairs contemplated can be approved through a division director letter under 312 IAC 20-4.

Jonathon Young, project manager for Browning Day Mullins, Dierdorf, said the State Fair would like to do a stabilization project on the rest of the barns. The chimneys are deteriorating greatly on barns 1 and 6.

A meeting has been proposed with the applicant to discuss alternate materials and the removal of chimneys.

A motion to approve was made by Dan Kloc and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion passed unanimously.

Update on alternatives to the demolition of, Old SR 1 Bridge, over the Whitewater River, 0.5 mile south of the Town of Cedar Grove, Franklin County.

Mary Kennedy, INDOT, reported that the Seymour office is continuing to do the survey work required under the certificate of approval granted in February, 2012.

J. P. Hall, Indiana Landmarks, stated that he has been talking with interested locals about possibly taking ownership since the last Review Board meeting. The Whitewater Canal Trail Group is a possible interested group. He will be meeting with them again soon.

Grant Evaluation Criteria and Priorities for FY 2013 Historic Preservation Fund Grants

This agenda item regards the competitive grant evaluation criteria that will be used to score and rank Historic Preservation Fund subgrant proposals received in October 2012 for funding consideration in the 2013 grant cycle. Steve Kennedy presented the proposed grants evaluation criteria for FY 2013, based on the memorandum sent to Board members.

Jim Corridan asked if there is a program to encourage nominations to the National Register of districts targeted for nomination in the Architectural and Historical sub-grant category.

Malia Vanaman, Associate Grants Manager, answered that she is planning to communicate to potential sponsors of such nominations to encourage applications. Kennedy indicated that he hoped to have a ranked approval list for FY 2012 grants by the July Review Board meeting.

A notice of the availability of the draft priorities for the Historic Preservation Fund Matching Grants Program was distributed entirely by e-mail again this year. It was posted on our division's website and was further distributed by several other historical agencies with broad e-mail distribution systems. The communications directed constituents to the DHPA's website to review the proposed grant evaluation criteria, the grant program guidelines, and the sliding scale funding recommendations and requested that any written comments be submitted to our office no later than Friday, April 20.

There are very few changes proposed for 2013, as the grant evaluation criteria used in 2012 proved to be extremely effective. I will briefly reiterate the changes proposed in your packet and describe any public comments received.

Administrative Criteria

In the Administrative criteria beginning on page 3 of your packet, revisions include only annual changes of year references and an update of the number of CLG communities in Indiana. No adjustments were made to point values. The Minimum Administrative Score remains 65.0 points in order for proposals to be recommended for funding.

Architectural and Historical Criteria

The Architectural and Historical category begins on page 6 of your packet. This year, few changes were made to the evaluation criteria, and they include several instances of revised wording for improved clarity, several places where new application instructions were introduced, and one update to the list of Historic Districts Targeted for National Register Nomination. No adjustments were made to point values.

Archaeological Criteria

The Archaeology category begins on page 13 of your packet. Revision of the evaluation criteria includes only a single annual change of a year reference. No adjustments were made to the point values. Several changes are proposed to the Archaeological Goals and Objectives in order to address recent grant-funded work that has increased understanding of several previously data-deficient areas. Several changes are also proposed for the list of Special Topic Sites.

Acquisition and Development Criteria

The Acquisition and Development category begins on page 19 of your packet. Revision of the evaluation criteria includes only a single annual change of a year reference. No adjustments were made to the point values.

Historic Preservation Fund Grant Program Guidelines

The HPF Grant Program Guidelines begin on page 22 of your packet. This was a new section of the document first introduced in 2006, and it has worked very well for purposes of clarifying all of the procedures that the DHPA uses to administer the HPF Program. No changes are suggested for 2013, nor were any changes made to the Sliding Scale Funding Percentages Chart, as that is normally addressed every second year.

Public Comments

No public comments were received this year regarding either the evaluation criteria or the grant program guidelines.

A motion to approve was made by Richard Butler and seconded by Jim Corrigan.
The motion passed unanimously.

Explanation of Proposed Rule for Dual Review of Projects Involving Review under Section 106 and Section 18.

Ron McAhrn, Deputy Director for Regulatory Affairs, Department of Natural Resources, gave the comments. Dual review has been discussed at the Advisory Council meetings. Refinement of IC14-21-1-18 through the proposed Dual Review rule follows the National Register Commission's actions on regulatory redundancy. Precedents have been set with permitting already. A Section 106 provides a broad opportunity for public participation. If no historic properties are affected or there's no adverse impact on historic properties, a review by the division still occurs; the proposed rule provides posting of projects on website. Interested parties and review board will be apprised. If an MOA is abandoned – the project goes to Review Board for C of A.

No questions.

Properties Listed in, Rejected by, or Removed from the National Register since the last Notification

Listed

ALLEN COUNTY

Akima Pinsiwa Awiiki (Chief Jean-Baptiste de Richardville House), 5705 Bluffton Rd., Fort Wayne, NATIONAL HISTORIC LANDMARK DESIGNATED, 3/02/12

CLARK COUNTY

Smith--Sutton Site, Address Restricted, Jeffersonville vicinity, 4/10/12

DELAWARE COUNTY

Minnetrista Boulevard Historic District, 400-650 Minnetrista Blvd., Muncie, 12000184, LISTED, 4/10/12

JASPER COUNTY

Rensselaer Courthouse Square Historic District, Roughly between Cullen & Front Sts. along W. Washington St., Rensselaer, 4/10/12

LAKE COUNTY

Bartlett Realty Company Model Homes of Beverly Shores MPS, COVER DOCUMENTATION ACCEPTED, 4/10/12

Pullman--Standard Historic District, Roughly bounded by Columbia, Field, Porter & Willard Aves., Hammond, 4/10/12 (Historic Residential Suburbs in the United States, 1830-1960 MPS)

MARSHALL COUNTY

Ramsay--Fox Round Barn and Farm, 18889 9th Rd., Plymouth vicinity, 4/10/12 (Round and Polygonal Barns of Indiana MPS)

TIPPECANOE COUNTY

Curtis--Grace House, 2175 Tecumseh Park Ln., West Lafayette, 4/10/12

Rejected

None

Removed

None

Set date for the next meeting

Proposed date: **July 25, 2012**, IGCS, Conference Room A, 1:30 p.m. (EDT)

Deadline for receipt of Certificate of Approval applications: June 15, 2012, 4:45 p.m. (EST)

A motion to adjourn was made by Dan Kloc and seconded by Richard Butler. The motion was unanimously approved.